Notes of a meeting of the
UK Medical Education Database Advisory Board
Friday 07 December, 10.30 – 13:30
Room 2.08 General Medical Council Regents Place, 350 Euston Road, London NW1 3JN

Attendees

Professor Steve Thornton	Chair
Professor Jon Dowell	Research Subgroup Chair
Dr Simon Fleming	AoMRC Trainees
Professor Stewart Irvine	COPMeD
Dr Sarah Hallett (*Deputy for Dr Anthea Mowat*)	BMA
Dr Gurdas Singh	BMA MSC
Mark Shannon	BMAT
Professor Colin Melville	GMC
Denise Jones	HESA
Dr Katie Petty-Saphon	MSC
Richard O'Kelly	UCAS
Professor Chris McManus	UCL
Rachel Greatrix	UKCAT
Thomas Oppe	GMC
Daniel Smith	GMC
Peter Tang	MSC
Edward Knight	MSC

By telephone

Ali Enayati (*Deputy for Alan Robson*)	DH
Jonathan Howes	HEE
Professor Keith Gardiner	NIMDTA

Apologies

Alastair Henderson	AoMRC
Professor Lesley Regan	AoMRC
Dr Anthea Mowat	BMA
Graeme Larkin	BMA
Alan Robson	DH
David Darton	GMC
Martin Hart	GMC
Nico Kirkpatrick	GMC
Marita MacMahon Ball	GAMSAT
Veronica Vele	GAMSAT
Adam Van Coevorden	HESA
Dr Tom Yapp	HEIW
Dr Duncan Henderson	NES
Russell Smith	UKFPO
Dr David Best	UCAS

1   Welcome and introductions   Chair

1. The chair welcomed members to the UKMED Advisory Board. Professor William Reid has retired from COPMeD and the UKMED Advisory Board, he thanked the Advisory Board and the UKMED team for all the good work coming out of the UKMED project. The Chair thanked Professor Reid for his contribution to the UKMED Advisory Board. Professor Dame Jane Dacre has stepped down as RCP President and the new AoMRC representative is Professor Lesley Regan.

2   Approval of minutes from 22 May 2018 and matters arising   Chair

2. The minutes of the meeting on 22 May 2018 were reviewed and approved as an accurate record. Actions from the previous meeting were reported to have either been completed or were in progress.

3. The action regarding carrying out a motivated intruder test was reviewed by the GMC. The GMC decided that the appropriate level of motivated intruder test would be too excessive, costly and time consuming, given the low level of risk. The GMC highlighted that penetration testing was carried out during UKMED's pilot stage.

4. The information governance around UKMED is compliant with the GDPR and is sufficient for protecting the data subjects' rights. The Advisory Board recommended the GMC to produce a policy paper outlining why a motivated intruder test is not required, given the appropriate safeguards and governance that it has put into place.

ACTION: Andrew Ledgard to create a UKMED policy paper outlining why a motivated intruder test is not required, given the current safeguards and governance in place.

3   UCAS update

5. Daniel Smith reported that the UKMED team were successful in linking the UCAS data to the HESA and test provider data. It was noted that the anonymous UCAS population data currently only contains an application identifier and not a person identifier, which means it will not be possible to identify applicants who apply to medicine more than once.

6. The UKCAT data contains UCAS person identifiers up to the 2014 entry year. UKMED does not hold UCAS person identifiers from 2015 onwards. The matching success rates with the test provider data were much better when UCAS person identifiers were used in the hashing algorithm. Rachel Greatrix explained that PEARSON VUE matched UKCAT to UCAS as part of the admissions process, so whilst UKCAT did not hold UCAS IDS in the UKCAT research dataset post 2014, it was possible they were available somewhere else for UKCAT to provide to the GMC.

ACTION: Daniel Smith to explore with Rachel Greatrix and Richard O'Kelly solutions for achieving better data matching success rates with the UKCAT data.

ACTION: UCAS to supply a table with the current RPD identifier and an RPD person identifier which is invariant across application cycles.

4   UKMED Forum

7. Edward Knight reported that the Research Sub group's and Advisory Board's proposal for an online forum to enable the discussion of UKMED data was being developed. The forum will be open to current and prospective researchers and will be useful as a platform to answer questions about UKMED. Users will be able to search for frequently asked questions, potentially reducing the number of queries via the UKMED inbox.

8. The UKMED team will be able to moderate users and discussion topics. There will be clear rules around matters that should not be discussed, such as the disclosure of identifiable information. The forum is not likely to increase risk of data disclosure in anyway as prospective users will not have access to UKMED data, while current researchers who do have access to UKMED data are bound by the contracts they have signed.

9. The online forum will be ready for the UKMED Conference in March 2019.

5   UKMED Conference

10. Peter Tang reminded the Advisory Board that the UKMED Conference will be held on 15 March 2019. He reported that there was very good interest in the conference which was fully subscribed within a week of release. There is now a waiting list for attendees wishing to join the conference.

6   Information governance update

11. Thomas Oppé reported that the contract with HIC was being extended for another three years starting from December 2018, to maintain continuity.

12. Members were informed researchers will routinely be sent research evaluation forms to fill out for audit purpose at the end of their project.

13. Thomas Oppé updated the group with the changes made from the GDPR roll out. The data protection course in HIC and all UKMED information governance documents have now been updated to be GDPR compliant.

14. The research process documents are in the process of being updated to reflect the General Data Protection Regulations (GDPR) and a number of process improvements. Daniel Smith will circulate the documents to Members via email for comments with a view to publish the final versions on the UKMED website in February 2019.

ACTION: Evaluation forms to be sent routinely to researchers at the end of their project by OSK.

ACTION: Daniel Smith to send the updated research process documents to Advisory Board Members for comments. Advisory Board Members to provide comments by 18th January 2019.

7   HESA new contract process

15. Daniel Smith informed Members that there is one more year on the existing contract, which will cover the 2017/18 HESA data to be supplied in March 2019. The 2017/18 dataset will include new fields containing data on protected characteristics and flagging students who transfer internally onto a medicine course from a biomedicine course. The data field flagging students who transfer from a biomedical course could help explain some data anomalies in the HESA data where students suddenly appear in the second year of the medicine course, without having completed year one.

16. It was noted that the GMC information governance team were performing a privacy impact assessment on the additional protected characteristics proposed for inclusion in the 2017/18 extract.

17. The 2018/19 HESA data will include the new medical schools. The GMC's new school team have a briefing note to provide to the new medical schools about correctly coding medical students to 'Regulatory Body 01' to ensure that data are correctly submitted to HESA.

18. When HESA's data futures programme is implemented, UKMED will receive HESA data extracts twice a year. The GMC is looking to obtain assessment data under the new HESA contract and the specification must be agreed by August 2019 for the 2020/21 HESA extract; for 2021/11 the specification would need agreement by August 2020

ACTION: Daniel Smith to confirm with MLA team which year we should collect assessment data from.

8   Medical school specific extract in safe haven

19. In relation to the action to include module data in UKMED, Daniel Smith reported that the GMC and MSC have visited two medical schools to discuss submitting assessment data through HESA. The medical schools visited expressed interest in receiving UKMED data extracts for students that studied at their medical school.

20. The Members were asked whether UKMED should offer the medical schools access to extracts containing their own students for internal analysis only.

21. It was noted that UKCAT offered similar provisions for medical schools in the past but was rarely used, although the data were in aggregate format rather than row level data.

22. The Members supported the action but recommended the UKMED team to gather more information on whether there was genuine interest by medical schools to utilise the data.

ACTION: UKMED team to gather more information about making extracts available to medical schools.

9   UKMED data load cycle and calendar

23. Daniel Smith presented the 2019 UKMED data load cycle and calendar. He explained that the undergraduate data that UKMED was receiving will be slightly out of sync due to lag times in data collections from various data providers. The HESA data is roughly 18 months out of sync with the most current UCAS data, however, HESA will be moving towards in year reporting in 2020. He stressed the importance of data providers keeping UKMED data submissions to the agreed calendar to avoid delays to data loads.

10.   Terms of Reference update

24. Peter Tang asked Members whether there were any comments on the updated UKMED Advisory Board Terms of Reference.

25. Members noted that the list of organisations requires further updates due to organisational name changes, and that the reference to elections for future chairmanship be changed to 'advertise and apply'. It was also noted that a GMC Medical Licensing Assessment (MLA) colleague will be joining the UKMED Advisory Board.

ACTION: Peter Tang to make the required changes to the Terms of Reference.

11   Status of active projects

26. The Research Sub-Group Chair provided an update from the meeting on 23 November 2018.

27. The Research Sub-Group expressed interest in seeking contextual data from medical schools on their processes for recording reasonable adjustments to understand why UKMEDP54 had found that that the reporting of specific learning disabilities had increased over time. This was thought to have implications for the running of the future MLA as extra time allowed on exams will depend on local university policy. The Members support the collection of this information.

28. The Research Sub-Group reviewed three reports for publication (UKMEDP32, UKMEDP38, UKMEDP41) and all three were recommended for publication.

12   Research applications from Research subgroup 23 November 2018

29. A total of eight applications were received in the latest round with three being invited for resubmission (UKMEDP93, UKMEDP95, UKMEDP96) and four being recommended (UKMEDP87, UKMEDP88, UKMEDP89, UKMEDP91). The Advisory Board accepted the recommendations from the Research Sub-Group with the exception of UKMEDP86 which generated considerable discussion.

30. UKMEDP86 recommended by the Research Sub-Group received further discussion from the Advisory Board Members. Chris McManus, Daniel Smith and Peter Tang declared their conflict of interest as applicants on the UKMEDP86 application. The project is a descriptive piece of research aimed at producing a publicly accessible

database with detailed aggregate measures drawn from the UKMED database.

31. Members advised caution over making a range of aggregated descriptive data publicly available, citing that descriptive data without context could generate unintended consequences if misinterpreted. It was noted that the information was not particularly sensitive as it could be currently obtained through freedom of information (FOI) requests.

32. Members recognised the benefits of the project by providing a solid evidence base to answer some of the questions asked by the sector. BMA MSC believed that this information would be useful for medical students or those planning to make an application to medicine, but any release should be accompanied by appropriate caveats and context. It was acknowledged that the UKMED project had a duty of due diligence to ensure that the diverse audiences who have access to the information will process this responsibility in a balanced way.

33. It was agreed that it is important to consult the medical schools about whether the data should be published and made available to the public, and to assess the risk of unintended consequences from the publication. The Members recommended the UKMEDP86 team to produce a worked example and a paper showing the available options for the project at the next Advisory Board for further discussion.

34. Edward Knight and Olga Sierocinska King are developing a tracker dashboard to enable the UKMED team to monitor delays in projects. The dashboard will be made public once refinements to the system have been applied. The dashboard will also be useful for providing prospective applicants to UKMED with an accurate expectation of how long a UKMED project lasts to ensure appropriate resources are secured to complete the project.

ACTION: UKMEDP86 team to produce a worked example and project paper outlining the options for database release for the May 2019 Advisory Board meeting.

13   AOB – Archiving key documents

35. This item was withdrawn.

14   AOB – 2019 meeting dates

36. The 2019 UKMED Advisory Board meeting dates are:
    a. Friday 17 May 2019, 10.00–14.00. GMC, Regent's Place, 350 Euston Road, London, NW1 3JN.
    b. Wednesday 20 November 2019, 12.00–16.00. Medical Schools Council, Woburn House, Tavistock Square, Kings Cross, London WC1H 9HD.

Session 2

15   UKMED workforce planning users – Applications of UKMED data for workforce profiling (NES)

37. Due to technical difficulties the planned presentation did not go ahead.

Summary of actions from Friday 07 December 2018 UKMED Advisory Board meeting and carried forward from earlier meetings

Action from Dec 2018		Status
(i)	To obtain MMI data from medical schools.	In progress
(ii)	To collect module data from medical schools.	In progress
(iii)	Ed Knight to add the 2018 calendar to the UKMED website.	In progress
(iv)	Research Sub-Group to develop a check list and a dashboard for researchers to monitor and check their progress towards publication.	In progress
(v)	Daniel Smith to draft a project proposal which would include seeking assistance from the York team. The proposal will be reported back to the Advisory Board in Spring 2019.	In progress – for Spring 2019
(vi)	UKMED team to explore setting up a user group or webinars for UKMED researchers to exchange ideas and good practice.	In progress – ETA March 2019.
(vii)	Andrew Ledgard to put together a UKMED policy paper outlining why a motivated intruder test is not required, given the current safeguards and governance in place.	
(viii)	Daniel Smith to explore with Rachel Greatrix and Richard O'Kelly solutions for achieving better data matching success rates.	
(ix)	UCAS to supply a table with the current RPD identifier and an RPD person identifier which is invariant across application cycles.	

(x)	Evaluation forms to be sent routinely to researchers at the end of their project by OSK.	
(xi)	Daniel Smith to send the updated research process documents to Advisory Board Members for comments. Advisory Board Members to provide comments by 18th January 2019.	
(xii)	Daniel Smith to confirm with MLA team which year we should collect assessment data from.	
(xiii)	UKMED team to gather more information about making extracts available to medical schools.	
(xiv)	Peter Tang to make the required changes to the Terms of Reference.	
(xv)	UKMEDP86 team to produce a worked example and project paper outlining the options for database release for the May 2019 Advisory Board meeting.	

Glossary

ADRN	Administrative Data Research Network, *www.ADRN.ac.uk*
AoMRC	Academy of Medical Royal Colleges, *www.aomrc.org.uk*
ARCP	Annual Review of Competence Progression
BMA	British Medical Association, *www.bma.org.uk*
BMAT	BioMedical Admissions Test, *www.admissionstestingservice.org/for-test-takers/bmat/about-bmat*
COPMeD	Conference of Postgraduate Medical Deans (UK), *www.copmed.org.uk*
DH	Department of Health, *www.gov.uk/government/organisations/department-of-health*
DPA	Data Protection Act, *www.gov.uk/data-protection/the-data-protection-act*
EEA	European Economic Area
EPM	Educational Performance Measure
FPAS	Foundation Programme Application System
FtP	Fitness to Practise
GAMSAT	Graduate Medical School Admissions Test, *www.gamsat.acer.edu.au*
GDPR	General Data Protection Regulation, *https://www.gov.uk/government/collections/data-protection-act-2018*
GMC	General Medical Council, *www.gmc-uk.org*
HEE	Health Education England, *www.hee.nhs.uk*
HEIW	Health Education and Improvement Wales, *www.heiw.nhs.wales*
HES	Hospital Episode Statistics, *www.digital.nhs.uk/data-and-information/data-tools-and-services/data-services/hospital-episode-statistics*
HESA	Higher Education Statistics Agency, *www.hesa.ac.uk*
HIC	Health Informatics Centre, *www.medicine.dundee.ac.uk/hic*
IS	Information Services (part of GMC)
LRMP	List of Registered Medical Practitioners
MSC	Medical Schools Council, *www.medschools.ac.uk*
NES	NHS Education for Scotland, *www.nes.scot.nhs.uk*
NIHR	National Institute for Health Research, *www.nihr.ac.uk*
NIMDTA	Northern Ireland Medical and Dental Training Agency, *www.nimdta.gov.uk*
PID	Project Initiation Documentation
PIRE	Project Implementation Review and Evaluation
PSA	Prescribing Safety Assessment
SEC	Socio-Economic Classification
SJT	Situational Judgement Test
UCAS	Universities and Colleges Admissions Service, *www.ucas.com*
UCL	University College London
UKCAT	UK Clinical Aptitude Test, *www.ukcat.ac.uk*
UKFPO	UK Foundation Programme Office, *www.foundationprogramme.nhs.uk*
WPG	Work Psychology Group, *www.workpsychologygroup.com*