

## Notes of a meeting of the UK Medical Education Database Advisory Board

Wednesday 20 November, 12.00 – 16:00

UUK Board Room, Woburn House, 20-24 Tavistock Square, London, WC1H 9HQ

### Attendees

Professor Jon Dowell	Deputy Chair/Research Subgroup Chair
Dr Katie Petty-Saphon	MSC
Dr Latifa Patel (Deputy)	BMA
Dr Chris Smith	BMA MSC
Mark Shannon	BMAT
Professor Elizabeth Hughes	HEE
Dr Duncan Henderson	NES
Rachel Greatrix	UCAT
Professor Chris McManus	UCL
Dr Mike Masding	UKFPO
Professor Colin Melville	GMC
Andrew Ledgard	GMC
Daniel Smith	GMC
Kate Gregory	GMC
Tom Bandenburg	GMC
Tom Oppé	GMC
Peter Tang	MSC
Edward Knight	MSC

### By telephone

Adam Van Coevorden	HESA
Richard O'Kelly	UCAS
Alistair MacLeod	GAMSAT
Clare Wright (Deputy)	HEE
Denise Hughes (Deputy)	NIMDTA

### Apologies

Keeley Dilworth (Observer)	CRUK
Professor Steve Thornton	Chair
Dr Simon Fleming	AoMRC Trainees
Dr Helena McKeown	BMA
Alan Robson	DH
Martin Hart	GMC
Nico Kirkpatrick	GMC
Professor Bill Irish	COPMed
Jonathan Howes	HEE
Dr Helen Baker	HEIW
Professor Keith Gardiner	NIMDTA
Dr David Best	UCAS
Alastair Henderson	AoMRC
Dr Gurdas Singh	BMA MSC
Nadja Koller	GAMSAT
David Darton	GMC
Denise Jones	HESA
Rachel Wilkes	HESA

## **1 Welcome and introductions      Chair**

1. The Chair, Professor Steve Thornton, was unable to attend the UKMED Advisory Board meeting. The meeting was chaired by Professor Jon Dowell, the Chair of the Research Subgroup. The deputy chair welcomed members to the UKMED Advisory Board.

## **2 Approval of minutes from 17 May 2019 and matters arising      Chair**

2. The minutes of the meeting on 17 May 2019 were reviewed and approved as an accurate record. Actions from the previous meeting were reported to have either been completed or were in progress.

## **3 UCAS update**

3. Daniel Smith reported that new UCAS data going back to 2007 have now been loaded into UKMED. This new data load includes new data fields, the school the application was submitted from and applicant qualifications.
4. UCAS person identifiers and have replaced the hashed IDs which were previously used for matching to UKMED. The linkage using UCAS person identifiers returned much better match rates, with 99% of UCAS data from 2007-2016 successfully linked to HESA data. Linkage from HESA data to UCAS data was slightly lower, but this could be explained by some students entering medicine without an UCAS application.
5. Plans for reporting on the applicant and entry profiles using UCAS and HESA data were presented to the Advisory Board. The UKMED team are currently exploring whether there are enough resources to investigate discrepancies between the UCAS and HESA data sources.
6. The Advisory Board discussed plans to update the paper describing UKMED, '*The UK medical education database (UKMED) what is it? Why and how might you use it?*' as it is now out of date due to new datasets added to the database. The Advisory Board were happy for the UKMED team to produce an updated paper or a living document for publication.

**ACTION:** Daniel Smith to document discrepancies and send to UCAS and HESA.

**ACTION:** Daniel Smith/Peter Tang to start drafting an updated paper describing UKMED.

## **4 Including UCAS data in workforce planning extracts**

7. The workforce planning extracts now include the UCAS dataset to give a full view of the pipeline coming into medicine. The Safe Haven users who have access to this currently include the Medical Schools Council, NHS Education for Scotland and DHSC Workforce Information and Analysis.
8. The Deputy Chair and the Advisory Board thanked UCAS for their ongoing support of the project.

## 5 Improving efficiency of the Safe Haven

9. Daniel Smith explained to the Advisory Board that to accommodate the increase in the volume of data, the GMC were exploring ways to improve the efficiency of delivering data extracts to the Safe Haven. Rather than create individual extracts from the UKMED database and transfer this into the Safe Haven, the GMC proposes to put a pseudonymised UKMED database into the Safe Haven. Sensitive data tables such as FtP data will not be included in this. The GMC's information governance team is investigating whether the approach complies with data regulations. Chris McManus recognised the need to have an approach to dealing with the volume of data to improve performance within the Safe Haven,

**ACTION:** The GMC to provide an update at the next Advisory Board meeting including the information governance review.

## 6 HESA assessment data and medical school extracts update

- 6 Tom Bandenburg updated the Advisory Board on the progress of acquiring assessment data from medical schools. Medical schools were invited to workshops to feedback on the original proposals. Further consultation with the medical schools was completed with the help of HESA through their online system. The GMC presented a scaled back proposal to the Medical Schools Council. The GMC will present the proposal to the Medical Schools Council Assessment Alliance (MSCAA) with further detail about the project. The UKMED Research Subgroup have also offered to write potential research questions that could only be answered using detailed assessment data, to be presented to the MSCAA.
- 7 In the interim, the GMC will collect assessment data via spreadsheets. The template for these will be confirmed by Summer 2020, ready for data to be returned for all assessment taking place in the academic year 2020/21 cohort of medical students.
- 8 Dr Chris Smith queried whether the assessment data could be used for ranking students or making judgements about individuals. [Dr Latifa Patel expressed concern that the data could be used to prematurely rank universities with limited data such as those from the MLA.](#) The GMC clarified that the assessment data in UKMED cannot be used to make decisions about individuals. The assessment data is being sought by UKMED to answer broader research questions around undergraduate progression.
- 9 The Deputy Chair thanked the GMC for their work in helping move forward the acquiring of assessment data.

## 7 Clinical outcome data update

- 10 The project that would provide a proof of concept to link medical education to clinical practice requires data from NHS Digital. The project aims to investigate whether there is a link between doctors' medical education and following published clinical guidelines. It is being led by a team in York with experience in Hospital Episode Statistics data.
- 11 The application for data from NHS Digital is currently under review with the NHS Digital's governance team. Daniel Smith reported that progress on this was slow.

**ACTION:** The GMC to continue supporting the project and chase NHS Digital for a response in March 2020. GMC to consider escalating to more senior staff at NHS Digital.

**8 Doctors mental health project (DMH): Secondary data analysis of mental health care records of doctors in Wales via SAIL databank**

- 12 The GMC was approached by SAIL to participate in a research project on doctors' mental health wellbeing in Wales. The GMC's internal review concluded that they could not hold health records of doctors and that the project would require sharing data with SAIL, through third party linkage to ensure data was anonymised to the researchers. The project has the potential to answer questions around mental health and clinical training.
- 13 Advisory Board members recognised the importance and impact of the project but had some concerns about the small number of doctors based in Wales and the generalisability of the research findings.
- 14 The BMA queried whether the privacy notices displayed covered data linkage to doctors' and medical students' health records. It was noted that this was not anticipated when UKMED was originally set up. Members queried whether this would be a reasonable expectation for data subjects to have regarding the uses of their data. The BMA voiced concerns with regards to linking UKMED data to doctors' mental and physical health records, and the risk posed by possible reidentification of doctors within the data. Any transfer of data to third parties outside of UKMED must be subject to robust data governance which will hold up to scrutiny in the future.
- 15 Professor Jon Dowell reported that the proposal was discussed at the Research Subgroup and recommended the GMC to explore the governance around supplying data to SAIL and understand how the third-party linkage works.

**ACTION:** The GMC to ask SAIL for more detail about the project and its governance.

**9 UKMEDP086**

- 16 The Advisory Board meeting in May 2019 recommended a collaboration with the Medical Schools Council Selection Alliance (MSCSA) to consider the controlled release of descriptive aggregated data tables proposed in UKMEDP086. Peter Tang reported that the MSCSA were happy to collaborate and incorporate this into the applicant and entrant profile reports that are currently being developed. This will ensure Medical Schools can review reports before being published.
- 17 PT explained that the proof of concept will report on the test provider scores used on selection into medicine. The Advisory Board recognised the information could be useful for applicants applying to Medical Schools.

**ACTION:** PT to include BMAT, UCAT and GAMSAT in the review of the applicant and entrant profile reports.

**ACTION:** PT and DS to bring final design of the applicant and entrant profile reports to UKMED Advisory Board in June 2020.

## 10. UKMED data load cycle and calendar

- 18 Daniel Smith updated the Advisory Board on the new data added to the UKMED database. The questionnaire for the UKMACS study will be included in the UKMED dataset but only available to other researchers after the UKMACS team have published.
- 19 Daniel Smith presented to the Board the 2019 load cycle. The GMC were successful in obtaining signed Data Sharing Agreements for Foundation e-Portfolio data from all four UK nations. The data will be loaded into UKMED in July. E-Portfolio data for foundation trainees will be supplied to UKMED. The Scottish e-Portfolio data was still awaiting sign off from NES.
- 20 Daniel Smith reported that through the UKMEDP038 project he found cases where students excluded from UK Medical Schools, as reported in HESA, later returned to join the GMC register after obtaining a medical degree overseas. The GMC acknowledged that while they know about these cases, UKMED governance does not permit them to act or make decisions about individuals. Currently, the GMC asks doctors joining the register to self-declare matters of fitness to practice, and it is acknowledged that this approach fails to pick up cases where doctors do not voluntarily disclose information. The GMC will work with the MSC to investigate the scale of the problem by cross referencing HESA data with the MSC's excluded students database.

**ACTION:** DS to seek assistance from DH to regarding Scottish e-Portfolio data.

## 11 & 12 Project progression and status of active projects

- 21 Daniel Smith presented to the Advisory Board an overview of active UKMED projects.
  - a. UKMEDP54 - *Declared disability in the UKMED dataset 2002-2016: an exploratory descriptive analysis*. Report expected Q1 2020.
  - b. UKMEDP57 - *Selection tests as a predictor of acceptance rate and post-graduate success of widening participation students in undergraduate medicine*. Work has commenced.
  - c. UKMEDP58 - *Modelling the consultant physician workforce*. Work is underway, but this could possibly change to a workforce planning project.
  - d. UKMEDP73 - *Recruitment of trainees to obstetrics and gynaecology training programme*. Survey completed by 2 thirds of medical schools. In process of chasing the remaining medical schools up. Unable to progress with data analysis because funding originally promised by RCOG, now not secured. Currently exploring other funding streams through the RCOG, Newcastle university and with HEE.
  - e. UKMEDP85 - *Evaluating the outcomes and impact of less than full time training on the medical workforce*. Draft report written by early spring 2020

which coincides with upgrade from MPhil to PhD at UCL.

- f. UKMEDP88 - *Investigating associations of post-graduate examination performance with socio-demographic characteristics, performance at medical school, medical school, SJT and foundation school: a focus on first stage examinations of MRCP, MRCGP and MRCPsych.* Expected to be able to submit a draft report by April 2020.
- g. UKMEDP89 - *The UK Medical Applicant Cohort Study: Applications and Outcomes Study.* Data will be refreshed Nov/Dec 2019.
- h. UKMEDP91 - *Do Access to HE qualifications and widening participation in medicine.* Will be rescoped to consider UCAS data.
- i. UKMEDP97 - *Investigating Core Medical Trainees' experience of the training environment and associations with workplace-based assessments, progression, training and examination outcomes from an Equality & Diversity (E&D) perspective.* Researchers have ORIEL data quality queries on CMT interview scores.

22 The Deputy Chair thanked the UKMED team for keeping track the progression of projects and noted it was reassuring that a substantial number of projects were moving along with reports promised in the 1<sup>st</sup> half of 2020.

### 13 Research applications from Research subgroup 7 November 2019

23 Only one application was received in the latest round.

24 The project was recommended to the Advisory Board with suggested changes:

- a. UKMEDP110 - Demographic predictors of performance on Multiple Mini Interviews for selection to undergraduate medical programmes in the UK.

25 The Advisory Board accepted the recommendations from the Research Sub-Group.

26 Two final reports and two interim reports were submitted to the Research Subgroup for review. The final reports were recommended for publication and the interim reports were recommended to progress towards publication.

27 The Deputy Chair drew the Advisory Board's attention to the UKMEDP051 interim report reviewed at the Research Subgroup that had some interesting findings. The paper compared the predictive validity of the medical school selection tests on postgraduate exam outcomes and the EPM. Both UCAT and BMAT were predictive of future performance. The analysis involving GAMSAT is still in progress.

28 The Deputy Chair highlighted the discussion at the Research Subgroup around developing a formal process for reviewing UKMED projects more frequently. The Research Subgroup will set up review windows every three months to enable a quick turn around of reports. This has been set up to accommodate requests to submit findings to conferences or PhD publications and may not align with the two UKMED Research Subgroup meetings that are held each year.

29 The Deputy Chair took this opportunity to thank Professor Sandra Nicholson representing UCAT on the Research Subgroup and attended her last meeting.



**ACTION:** PT to send BMAT, UCAT and GAMSAT the revised interim report and final reports from UKMEDP051.

**ACTION:** PT to invite UKMEDP051 researchers to present their findings at the June 2020 UKMED Advisory Board.

## 15 AOB – Supporting sector wide analysis and reviews

- 30 UKFPO approached UKMED to assist with the Foundation Programme Review. No formal process is currently set up to deal with this type of request and the UKMED team sought approval from the Research Subgroup and Advisory Board Chairs. Peter Tang, who already has access to existing UKMED data through the workforce planning extracts, was given access to additional UKFPO data to assist with the review. UKFPO signed a data sharing agreement to authorise the release of their data to Peter Tang to conduct analyses.
- 31 The Advisory Board was asked how UKMED can support the sector with data. Daniel Smith explained that data providers could access their own data with linked UKMED data in the Safe Haven, similar to the arrangements for workforce planning users. Data sharing agreements are signed that can restrict the purpose of the data processing.
- 32 Members discussed whether reports using UKMED data, whether for internal or public consumption, require the same rigour of review as UKMED projects. While any reports that go in the public domain are required to come back to UKMED, it was noted that the Research Subgroup does not currently function as group to police the work of stakeholders. Members agreed that the system to support sector wide analysis and reviews could be approached with a lighter touch given appropriate governance is in place.

**ACTION:** UKMED team to draft governance for access to UKMED data to support sector wide analysis and reviews.

## 16 AOB – 2020 meeting dates

- 33 Monday 29 June 2020, 10.30–14.30  
GMC, Regent’s Place, 350 Euston Road, London, NW1 3JN
- 34 Friday 18 December 2020, 10.30–14.30  
GMC, Regent’s Place, 350 Euston Road, London, NW1 3JN

## Summary of actions from Wednesday 20 November 2019 UKMED Advisory Board meeting and carried forward from earlier meetings

Action from May 2019	Status
(i) To obtain MMI data from medical schools.	In progress

(ii)	To collect module data from medical schools. Update: Schools do not use module data, the proposal is now to use assessment data.	In progress
(iii)	Research Sub-Group to develop a check list and a dashboard for researchers to monitor and check their progress towards publication.	In progress
(iv)	UKMED team to explore setting up a user group or webinars for UKMED researchers to exchange ideas and good practice.	In progress – ETA March 2019
(v)	Andrew Ledgard to put together a UKMED policy paper outlining why a motivated intruder test is not required, given the current safeguards and governance in place.	To be circulated offline
(vi)	Evaluation forms to be sent routinely to researchers at the end of their project by OSK.	In progress
(vii)	Daniel Smith and Olga Sierocinska King update the publication rules for publications including preliminary findings presented at conferences.	In progress
(viii)	Daniel Smith to document discrepancies and send to UCAS and HESA.	
(ix)	Daniel Smith/Peter Tang to start drafting an updated paper describing UKMED.	
(x)	The GMC to provide an update at the next Advisory Board meeting including the information governance review.	
(xi)	The GMC to continue supporting the project and chase NHS Digital for a	



	response in March 2020. GMC to consider escalating to more senior staff at NHS Digital.	
(xii)	The GMC to ask SAIL for more detail about the project and its governance.	
(xiii)	PT to include BMAT, UCAT and GAMSAT in the review of the applicant and entrant profile reports.	
(xiv)	PT and DS to bring final design of the applicant and entrant profile reports to UKMED Advisory Board in June 2020.	
(xv)	DS to seek assistance from DH to regarding Scottish e-Portfolio data.	
(xvi)	PT to send BMAT, UCAT and GAMSAT the revised interim report and final reports from UKMEDP051.	
(xvii)	PT to invite UKMEDP051 researchers to present their findings at the June 2020 UKMED Advisory Board.	
(xviii)	UKMED team to draft governance for access to UKMED data to support sector wide analysis and reviews.	

## Glossary

AoMRC	Academy of Medical Royal Colleges, <a href="http://www.aomrc.org.uk">www.aomrc.org.uk</a>
ARCP	Annual Review of Competence Progression
BMA	British Medical Association, <a href="http://www.bma.org.uk">www.bma.org.uk</a>
BMAT	BioMedical Admissions Test, <a href="http://www.admissionstesting-service.org/for-test-takers/bmat/about-bmat">www.admissionstesting-service.org/for-test-takers/bmat/about-bmat</a>
COPMeD	Conference of Postgraduate Medical Deans (UK), <a href="http://www.copmed.org.uk">www.copmed.org.uk</a>
DH	Department of Health, <a href="http://www.gov.uk/government/organisations/department-of-health">www.gov.uk/government/organisations/department-of-health</a>
DPA	Data Protection Act, <a href="http://www.gov.uk/data-protection/the-data-protection-act">www.gov.uk/data-protection/the-data-protection-act</a>
EEA	European Economic Area
EPM	Educational Performance Measure
FPAS	Foundation Programme Application System
FtP	Fitness to Practise
GAMSAT	Graduate Medical School Admissions Test, <a href="http://www.gamsat.acer.edu.au">www.gamsat.acer.edu.au</a>
GDPR	General Data Protection Regulation, <a href="https://www.gov.uk/government/collections/data-protection-act-2018">https://www.gov.uk/government/collections/data-protection-act-2018</a>
GMC	General Medical Council, <a href="http://www.gmc-uk.org">www.gmc-uk.org</a>
HEE	Health Education England, <a href="http://www.hee.nhs.uk">www.hee.nhs.uk</a>
HEIW	Health Education and Improvement Wales, <a href="http://www.heiw.nhs.wales">www.heiw.nhs.wales</a>
HES	Hospital Episode Statistics, <a href="http://www.digital.nhs.uk/data-and-information/data-tools-and-services/data-services/hospital-episode-statistics">www.digital.nhs.uk/data-and-information/data-tools-and-services/data-services/hospital-episode-statistics</a>
HESA	Higher Education Statistics Agency, <a href="http://www.hesa.ac.uk">www.hesa.ac.uk</a>
HIC	Health Informatics Centre, <a href="http://www.medicine.dundee.ac.uk/hic">www.medicine.dundee.ac.uk/hic</a>
IS	Information Services (part of GMC)
LRMP	List of Registered Medical Practitioners
MSC	Medical Schools Council, <a href="http://www.medschools.ac.uk">www.medschools.ac.uk</a>
NES	NHS Education for Scotland, <a href="http://www.nes.scot.nhs.uk">www.nes.scot.nhs.uk</a>
NIHR	National Institute for Health Research, <a href="http://www.nihr.ac.uk">www.nihr.ac.uk</a>
NIMDTA	Northern Ireland Medical and Dental Training Agency, <a href="http://www.nimdtta.gov.uk">www.nimdtta.gov.uk</a>
PID	Project Initiation Documentation
PIRE	Project Implementation Review and Evaluation
PSA	Prescribing Safety Assessment
SEC	Socio-Economic Classification
SJT	Situational Judgement Test
UCAS	Universities and Colleges Admissions Service, <a href="http://www.ucas.com">www.ucas.com</a>
UCL	University College London
UCAT	University Clinical Aptitude Test, <a href="http://www.ucat.ac.uk">www.ucat.ac.uk</a>
UKFPO	UK Foundation Programme Office, <a href="http://www.foundationprogramme.nhs.uk">www.foundationprogramme.nhs.uk</a>
WPG	Work Psychology Group, <a href="http://www.workpsychologygroup.com">www.workpsychologygroup.com</a>