

Notes of a meeting of the UK Medical Education Database Development Group

Friday 23 January 2015, 13.30 – 16.00
Boardroom, Woburn House, Tavistock Square, WC1H 9HD

Attendees

| | |
|--|-------------------------------------|
| Prof Steve Thornton | Chair |
| Dr J-P Besouw | AoMRC |
| Janet Brown | UKFPO |
| Luke Bruce | GMC |
| Paul Buckley | GMC |
| Harrison Carter | BMA MSC |
| Prof Jon Dowell | Chair, Research Group |
| Siobhan Fitzpatrick | MSC |
| Keith Gardiner (<i>by tel</i>) | NIMDTA |
| Prof Derek Gallen | HEW |
| Rachel Greatrix | UKCAT |
| Jonathan Howes (<i>by tel</i>) | HEE |
| Andrew Ledgard | GMC |
| Marita MacMahon-Ball (<i>by tel</i>) | GAMSAT |
| Sarah McElwee | BMAT |
| Prof Bill Reid | COPMeD and NES |
| Prof Chris McManus | Professor of Psychology and Medical |
| Education, UCL | |
| Dr Katie Petty-Saphon | MSC |
| Daniel Smith | GMC |
| Veronica Vele (<i>by tel</i>) | GAMSAT |
| Kirsty White | GMC |

Apologies

| | |
|---------------------------------|----------------|
| Dave Anson | GMC |
| Simon Beeston (<i>rep</i>) | BMAT |
| Charlie Bell | BMA MSC |
| Duncan Henderson (<i>rep</i>) | NES |
| Dr JP Lomas | AoMRC Trainees |
| Alan Robson | DH |
| Olga Sierocinska King | MSC |

1. Welcome and introductions

The Chair welcomed members to the meeting, and introductions were made. A warm welcome was extended to Sarah McElwee, attending her first Development Group meeting for Simon Beeston, to Marita MacMahon-Ball and Veronica Vele dialing in from Australia and to Keith Gardiner dialing in from Northern Ireland. Apologies were noted.

Members noted that Dr JP Lomas had joined the UKMED Development Group as the AoMRC Trainees representative, although sent apologies to this meeting.

The Chair thanked the GMC for the huge amount of work between meetings, and highlighted the importance of regular Development Group meetings to ensure transparency and collaboration across stakeholders, and direction in overcoming challenges as they arise.

2. Approval of minutes of the last meeting

Enc 1

The minutes of the previous meeting were agreed to be an accurate record. Actions arising were reviewed in turn.

- UKCAT data linkage to be addressed under item 3
- The inclusion of FP annual data within GMC data collection to be considered in future
- Until research requests are submitted to UKMED, it is unclear how contextual data collected by the GMC MSAR will be required. This is part of a longer term GMC data improvement project. NB The MSAR applies only 2012/13/14, and not earlier (i.e. cannot be matched with the 2007 UKMED tracked cohort)
- GAMSAT agreed to provide data for Phase One – Data Sharing Agreement signed, data to be provided after HESA data received
- Establishing quality of HESA school attainment data – ongoing
- Exploring alignment of postgraduate data collection and career destination survey – hope to be progressed as part of larger data improvement project
- Scoping of a safe haven – to be addressed under item 4
- Research subgroup membership – nominations had been received and the group had met that day.

3. Status update

Kirsty White updated members on progress since the October Development Group meeting. She emphasised that as this is a pathfinder project, the work outputs and timescales are indicative, and may yet change. The GMC has scoped options regarding data sharing, prioritising data quality and security.

The GMC, on behalf of the UKMED Development Group, has entered into lengthy discussions with HESA regarding incorporating its data on school attainment into the UKMED database, with the aim of reaching agreement by April 2015. The GMC and HESA have discussed the terms of the draft data sharing agreement that HESA submitted to the GMC in November but have not yet reached a conclusion, discussions are ongoing. Daniel Smith presented a tabled paper relating to the HESA dataset and the indicative matching methodology. Members noted that one limitation is that the HESA data may not be provided for medical students who had withdrawn from studies prior to the December census date in the first term. It was also queried whether all UCAS course code numbers were included in the proposed methodology.

Members supported continued work to gain HESA data, given that it would provide school attainment data for all applicants taking any of the three entry tests, and that it would provide

an additional test of data robustness regarding who has completed medical school and should link to the GMC register.

The GMC team is starting to explore what will constitute the 'value-added' reports (i.e. reports adjusted for prior attainment), but there is currently no standard method.

The GMC is aiming for a data dictionary by the summer in order to describe what is available to potential researchers.

The Development Group reviewed the Risk Register, noting the two current risks relate to reaching agreement with HESA, and the potential limitations of data in accounting for academic pathways followed.

ACTION: GMC to clarify whether HESA data can be provided for medical students studying at overseas campuses of UK medical schools

ACTION: GMC to check the UCAS course subject codes in the proposed HESA data.

ACTION: GMC to check how HESA student record handles students who leave prior to the census date.

4. Review of data sharing options

Andrew Ledgard summarised the considerations as part of the exploration of data sharing options. The four options explored were

- Disclosure under contract alone
- Access to an GMC hosted safe haven
- Access to an internally hosted physical safe haven
- Access to an externally hosted safe haven

There are significant costs associated with a safe haven, however these will depend on precisely what the contractor is asked to do. The four options are not mutually exclusive: a contract will always apply.

ACTION: GMC to report back on arrangements for data sharing at the next Development Group meeting

5. Research sub-group update

Enc 2

Professor Jon Dowell advised members that the group was making progress in setting up the processes for submitting and reviewing research requests. It was confirmed that all data requests – including those from organisations represented on the Development Group – should be reviewed and progressed through this single pathway. The process will need to add value, for example offering critique on the method, and it needs to be proportionate.

There are two aspects to the Research Sub Group ongoing role;

- Recommendation of the approval/not of research work and data release
- Review the quality of the output and advice on whether the research has adhered to

the research question the data was provided to answer

NB The GMC will also need to review and approve outputs as meeting the statistical disclosure control rules.

There was a discussion around the timeline of data being made available. A data request from UKCAT for FPAS data cannot currently be processed by the UKMED. It was agreed that this would be progressed offline.

The Research Sub-Group noted that to attract research proposals the sub-group recommends to the Development Group that there is a launch event to showcase the research potential, and in the short term, that a website is published.

The Development Group agreed that UKMED website information should be provided to support the data being made available – currently planned for the end of summer.

There was some discussion in the Group with members expressing preferences for:

- Branding independent of any individual stakeholder group, although all stakeholders should be acknowledged
- A .ac.uk domain for a stand-alone website
- FAQs as a priority to help members respond to queries for researchers as well as data subjects

In the immediate term, all stakeholders should be provided with a short communication and lines to take for use on their own websites.

Rachel Greatrix raised a concern that the UKCAT was not as involved in the Research Sub-Group as it would like to be. There was a request for the membership of the Research Sub-Group to include representatives of UKCAT and GAMSAT. It was noted that BMAT had nominated a member of the group. Members were reminded that the membership of the Research Sub-Group was to bring research expertise, rather than representation of stakeholders which is the case on the Development Group. There was agreement that nonetheless, the membership should be reviewed as the project progresses.

ACTION: MSC to develop a UKMED logo

ACTION: MSC to provide a short communications on UKMED to stakeholder organisations

ACTION: MSC consider the case for a UKMED website to be launched in summer 2015

6. Next steps and future meetings

Members noted the data of the next meeting, Friday 19th June (morning – timing tbc). It was agreed that future meetings should be held in the mornings to enable GAMSAT to dial in.

Minutes approved at the Development Group meeting 19 June 2015

Glossary

| | |
|--------|---|
| AoMRC | Academy of Medical Royal Colleges, www.aomrc.org.uk |
| ARCP | Annual Review of Competence Progression |
| BMA | British Medical Association, www.bma.org.uk |
| BMAT | BioMedical Admissions Test http://www.admissionstestingservice.org/for-test-takers/bmat/about-bmat/ |
| COPMeD | Conference Of Postgraduate Medical Deans (UK), www.copmed.org.uk |
| EPM | Educational Performance Measure |
| GAMSAT | Graduate Medical School Admissions Test, www.gamsat.acer.edu.au |
| GMC | General Medical Council, www.gmc-uk.org |
| HEE | Health Education England, www.hee.nhs.uk |
| HESA | Higher Education Statistics Agency, www.hesa.ac.uk |
| HIC | Health Informatics Centre, www.medicine.dundee.ac.uk/hic |
| ISFP | Improving Selection to the Foundation Programme, www.isfp.org.uk |
| LETB | Local Education and Training Board |
| MSAR | Medical School Annual Return |
| MSC | Medical Schools Council, www.medschools.ac.uk |
| NES | NHS Education for Scotland, www.nes.scot.nhs.uk |
| NIMDTA | Northern Ireland Medical and Dental Training Agency, www.nimmdta.gov.uk |
| PID | Project Initiation Documentation |
| SJT | Situational Judgement Test |
| UCAS | Universities and Colleges Admissions Service, www.ucas.com |
| UKFPO | UK Foundation Programme Office, www.foundationprogramme.nhs.uk |